

Memo

To: Stephanie Morris-Rashidpour, Senior Planner, FOTENN Planning and Design
From: Carl Bray, Bray Heritage
Date: Monday, May 7, 2018
RE: 321 Dalhousie Street/110 York Street: Revisions to December, 2012 CHIS

Dear Stephanie,

This is in response to your request for an updated heritage impact evaluation for the subject properties. In December 2012, Bray Heritage prepared a Cultural Heritage Impact Statement (CHIS) for the existing hotel building at 325 Dalhousie Street, in accordance with the City of Ottawa's requirements for such heritage impact assessments and submitted as part of the complete planning application for that project. Subsequent to the submission of the CHIS, it was determined that the existing 11 storey building on the property was not able to be salvaged. The building was demolished and the replacement building followed the scale and massing of the previous structure, with a six storey addition to the height. The Andaz hotel is the replacement building currently occupying the property at 325 Dalhousie Street.

Proposed development

Claridge Homes, owner of the subject lands as well as adjacent properties on Dalhousie and George Streets, is proposing an addition to the existing Andaz hotel located at 325 Dalhousie Street in downtown Ottawa. The addition is to be located on the adjacent parcel to the east located at 110 York Street and requiring access via a portion of the property at 137 George Street. The current development proposal requires a Zoning By-law Amendment in order to permit demolition of the current building at 110 York Street as well as replacement of surface parking in an interior courtyard. The proposed hotel addition will be 19 storeys (59.37 m.) in height and will add 136 new hotel units to the existing hotel.

As shown in the drawings included in the Planning Justification report (prepared by FOTENN Planning & Design), the proposed addition will have a ground floor podium occupying the entire property at 110 York Street while the upper floors will be set back from York Street (16.45 m. from the front of the podium) and recessed in the southwest corner to create access to light for existing hotel units on the east side of the current hotel. Floor plans and renderings of the proposed addition show glazing on the south, north and west sides of the building and a blank wall facing the existing surface parking lot to the east.

Existing conditions

As described in the December, 2012 CHIS, both the existing hotel at 325 Dalhousie Street and the existing building at 110 York Street are located within the Byward Market Heritage Conservation District (HCD,) designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Development within the HCD is regulated by the Byward Market Heritage Conservation District Study (September, 1990: Julian Smith & Assoc. et. al.). This study pre-dates the 2005 changes to the *Ontario Heritage Act* and contains elements of what would now be components of an HCD Study and HCD Plan.

Evaluations of properties found within the Byward Market HCD and contained in the HCD Study assess the existing property at 110 York Street as a Category 4 property. This is the lowest category of heritage value and indicates that the property has no heritage significance.

The existing building at 110 York Street was constructed soon after World War II and initially served as office space for the Union St. Joseph du Canada. Later, that organization converted the building to its current use as a bar and restaurant. It is a flat-roofed two storey brick and steel structure with concrete floors built to the street line and to the east property line. The 2012 CHIS re-affirmed the HCD Study's assessment of the property as having no heritage significance.

110 York Street abuts 325 Dalhousie Street to the west and has surface parking lots to the south and east. The nearest properties of heritage significance are:

- 126 York Street: 5 storey former warehouse (office with retail at grade) located east of the surface parking lot abutting 110 York Street. Built sometime between 1902 and 1948, it is a reinforced concrete structure with a brown brick curtain wall and ashlar stone detailing on the ground floor facade. The HCD Study evaluated the property as Category 2, the second highest level of heritage significance.
- 103-127 York Street: 2-3 storey brick house-form and apartment structures on the north side of York Street. These properties are also evaluated in the HCD Study as being Category 2.
- 101 York Street: 3 storey brick commercial/residential structure at the northeast corner of Dalhousie and York Street. It was evaluated in the HCD Study as Category 1, the highest level of heritage significance.

The subject property is also subject to a Heritage Overlay (Section 60 of the City of Ottawa Zoning Bylaw) related to the HCD. The Overlay would require a replacement structure for 110 York Street to match the existing structure's scale, massing, volume and floor area, on the same location.

Impact of the Proposed Development

The proposed demolition of the existing building at 110 York Street will remove a structure that has been evaluated as having no heritage significance in both the HCD Study and the 2012 CHIS. Accordingly, its removal and replacement with a larger structure will not remove a cultural heritage resource.

As for visual impact on the heritage character of the HCD, the addition to the hotel will continue the height of the existing building. When viewed from the main area of the Byward Market, the addition will be largely hidden behind the existing hotel. The addition will be visible within the HCD in angular views along Dalhousie Street and in facing views along York Street. In general, the addition will be seen in the context of a skyline that includes several highrise structures in the properties east of Dalhousie Street. Also, there is a proposal for a 22 storey residential building to be constructed behind the Dalhousie Street buildings, around the corner at 141 George Street. The addition will thus be part of the transition in height and massing from the predominantly low-scale existing development in the main market area to the higher density development area east of the market.

In terms of impact on nearby heritage properties, the proposed addition to the hotel will match the existing hotel in height but will have a smaller massing due to the substantial setback from York Street above the podium level. As a result, its massing will minimize shadow impact and permit angular views east along York Street of the 5 storey Category 2 building at 126 York Street. There will be no direct impact on the 126 York Street building as the existing surface parking lot will remain, and the proposed addition will also have no windows on the wall facing the existing fenestration on the west side of 126 York Street. The Category 1 and 2 properties across York Street will not be directly impacted and, due to the extra width of York Street east of Dalhousie Street (including a landscaped central median with mature trees), there will be minimal visual impact.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The foregoing report is an addendum to the Bray Heritage CHIS prepared in December, 2012 and submitted as part of the original development application for the hotel at 325 Dalhousie Street. The addendum is intended to accompany the complete planning application for a Zoning By-law Amendment to permit construction of a 19 storey addition to the existing hotel at 325 Dalhousie Street in the Byward Market Heritage Conservation District in downtown Ottawa. The Amendment also requests relief from the provisions of the Heritage Overlay that essentially require like-for-like replacement of existing structures in the District.

The existing building at 110 York has no heritage significance. It was rated as Category 4 (the lowest level, thus no heritage value) in the 1990 HCD Study and the 2012 CHIS re-affirmed this evaluation. As a result, replacement of the existing building will not negatively impact cultural heritage resources in the HCD. Relief from the provisions of the Heritage Overlay is therefore appropriate in this case.

The proposed addition to the existing hotel at 325 Dalhousie Street will have minimal visual impact on the views within the Byward Market HCD and will have no direct impact on properties identified with the HCD Study as having heritage significance. It will have a large setback from York Street which will allow angular views of the Category 2 building at 126 York Street and lessen the addition's shadow impact on that property and on Category 1 and 2 heritage properties located on the north side of York Street.

Respectfully submitted,

Carl Bray



Principal
Bray Heritage