

PLANNING RATIONALE ADDENDUM NO. 1

1354 & 1376 CARLING AVENUE

April 24, 2018

Mr. Sean Moore

Planner III, Development Review, South
City of Ottawa
110 Laurier Avenue West
Ottawa, ON K1P 1J1

**RE: 1354 and 1376 Carling Avenue – Planning Rationale Addendum No. 1
Zoning By-law Amendment and Site Plan Control Applications
File Nos. D02-02-17-0030, and D07-12-17-0041**

Dear Mr. Moore,

The Planning Rationale and Design Brief for the proposed mixed-use redevelopment of the properties at 1354 and 1376 Carling Avenue was submitted in April 2017 (dated April 21, 2017). The following Addendum No. 1 has been prepared to summarize changes to the development since the original submission, including adjustments to building heights, the public realm, surface parking areas, and access.

The Planning Rationale Addendum forms part of a comprehensive package of resubmission materials that reflect the extensive discussions with the City of Ottawa’s Urban Design Review Panel and City of Ottawa Staff over the past several months. These discussions have resulted in numerous changes to the Concept Plan for the full redevelopment of the lands as well as to the first phase of the redevelopment, which includes two new buildings on the east half of the lands and retention of the majority of the existing hotel.

It is Fotenn’s opinion that the conclusions of the April 2017 Planning Rationale remain valid in general and specifically with regards to the revised development. Reference should be made to the findings of the original report in addition to the rationale contained herein.

Summary of Design Changes

Since the initial submission to the City in April 2017, the plan has undergone significant revision. Following a July 6, 2017 review with the City of Ottawa’s Urban Design Review Panel (UDRP), a working session was scheduled with select members of the UDRP in September 2017. Based on the outcome of this review, the concept was refined and resubmitted without prejudice on December 1, 2017. Throughout early 2018, further refinements have been made to the development plan to reflect comments from Staff, the UDRP, the local Councillor, and the community.

The refinements are summarized as follows:

- / The existing “Japanese Steakhouse” annex of the existing hotel (the pyramid structure adjacent to Carling Avenue) was identified by the UDRP and City Staff as a heritage element representative of the original hotel architecture. The revised plans retain the pavilion and integrates it within the Phase 2 area;
- / A comment from both the community and City Staff was the need for a public park in the area. The revised Concept Plan includes a 1,400 square metre public park in the southwest corner of the site, along Meath Street;
- / As a result of the heritage retention and the public park, buildings have been re-oriented on the site, with the previous Building A split into two (2) buildings;

-
- / The central drive aisle has been revised to read as a public street, with parallel parking, ground-oriented residential units, terraces, and tree planting;
 - / The amount of surface parking has been drastically reduced and consolidated. All parking along the south property line has been removed to allow for a natural landscape buffer along this edge of the site. A pedestrian pathway through the site links the proposed public park to Archibald Street and provides an additional pedestrian/cycling access through the site;
 - / A sidewalk has been added along Archibald Street;
 - / The number of vehicular accesses along the side streets has been reduced from nine (9) to four (4);
 - / The proposed buildings along Carling Avenue remain at 20 storeys, with the central tower proposed at 22 storeys. All buildings feature a pedestrian-scaled podium of six (6) storeys and retail uses at-grade. Building C, in the northeast corner of the site will be constructed in Phase 1 and features ground floor retail space abutting Carling Avenue;
 - / Building D and E at the rear of the site have been reduced from nine (9) storeys to eight (8) storeys and now have a three (3) storey podium abutting the internal street and wrapping along Archibald Street in the east and the proposed public park in the west; Ground-oriented units and the three (3) storey heights will contribute to the transition into the residential community;
 - / Options for the Archibald and Meath Street connections have been examined including channelizing the north-only movement and closing the streets entirely. The transportation study prepared by Parsons recommends channelizing both and increasing signage to reinforce the existing one-way character of these streets however, through discussions with the Local Councillor and understanding community concerns, a second option where Meath Street is entirely closed to traffic has also been examined and drawings prepared. The property owner is willing to close the street, should that be the appropriate response to alleviate traffic concerns;
 - / Reduced the total number of residential units from 914 to 899;
 - / A total of 49 surface parking spaces are proposed in the ultimate build-out, while the balance of the parking is to be provided below-grade. In Phase 1, the underground parking garage provides a total of 273 spaces; and,
 - / A total of 200 bike parking spaces are provided within the underground garage, and at the surface.

The above list is not an exhaustive inventory of design changes. Reference should be made to the revised plans and studies for the details of the latest proposal.

Applications and Rezoning Requested

In April 2017, Fotenn submitted Zoning By-law Amendment and Site Plan Control applications for the lands at 1354 and 1376 Carling Avenue. The Zoning By-law Amendment sought to amend the zoning for the entire subject property to permit the phased mixed-use redevelopment of the lands. Following the submission, consultation with the City of Ottawa's Urban Design Review Panel (UDRP), Planning Staff, and the community have contributed to significant plan changes. The requested Zoning By-law Amendment seeks to permit a reduced building frontage along the front and corner side yards, and to increase the permitted building heights on the subject property.

Policy and Regulatory Framework

Provincial Policy Statement

The revised development is consistent with the policies of the Provincial Policy Statement (PPS), as described in the Planning Rationale prepared by Fotenn Consultants and dated April 2017.

City of Ottawa Official Plan

Managing Growth

The proposed plan modifications continue to conform to the overarching intent of the Official Plan policies on managing growth within the City of Ottawa. Arterial Mainstreets, like Carling Avenue adjacent to the subject property, are identified target areas for intensification. The proposed development continues to represent residential intensification of the lands within a target area for intensification.

Land Use Designation

The subject property is designated “Arterial Mainstreet” on Schedule B of the City of Ottawa Official Plan. Arterial Mainstreets are intended to offer significant opportunities for intensification through more compact forms of development, a lively mix of uses, and a pedestrian-friendly environment. Redevelopment and intensification along these corridors is encouraged to optimize the use of land. Building heights up to nine (9) storeys are generally permitted while greater building heights may be considered in accordance with the policies of Section 4.11.

The proposed revisions to the development conform to the policies of the Arterial Mainstreet designation and continue to satisfy the policies for the placement of greater building heights, as described in Section 4.11 and discussed below. The proposed development includes a mix of uses in a compact form that will help to frame the Carling Avenue street edge, and provides direct access to the pedestrian realm.

Compatibility

The proposed revisions to the development concept will not have any significant impact on the compatibility of the proposed building with the surrounding context per the objectives and principles of Section 2.5.1. The revised development is evaluated using the compatibility criteria of policy 2 in Section 4.11 below:

Criteria	Discussion
Traffic	The revised traffic study has looked at options to eliminate traffic on Thames Avenue as a result of the proposed development. Through consultations with the Local Councillor, an alternative plan is proposed wherein Meath Street would be closed to all vehicular traffic, leaving only Archibald Street open for northbound only vehicles. While not recommended from a technical transportation perspective, the closure of Meath would ensure that no traffic is going beyond Archibald Street to enter the proposed development.
Vehicular Access	The revised development reduces the number of vehicular access points from nine (9) to four (4) at the ultimate build-out. The main accesses remain the east-west private driveway between Archibald and Meath Street, and the north-south access from Carling Avenue. An additional access is provided directly from Archibald Street into the underground parking garage into Building E. The revised location of the vehicular access points will not have negative impacts with regards to noise, headlight glare, or loss of privacy on the adjacent properties.
Parking Requirements	The proposed parking strategy puts most of the parking below grade with 49 spaces at the surface for the retail uses at full build-out. The provided parking will minimize spillover onto adjacent streets while proximity to transit and pedestrian connections will encourage active modes of transportation. The revised parking layout removes significant surface parking areas that were previously proposed along the south property line, instead putting the parking below grade.

Outside Amenity Areas	The proposed development provides a 7.7 metre setback from the south property line before the three (3) storey podium and an additional 13.3 metre setback to the eight (8) storey building. Together, the 21.1 metre setback, combined with a new privacy fence and tree plantings along the southerly property line will protect the adjacent amenity areas and will mitigate potential impacts.
Loading and Service Areas, Outdoor Storage	All garbage rooms are located within the parking garages and all loading for the retail uses will occur internal to the site, away from adjacent land uses. No outdoor storage is proposed.
Lighting	Site lighting will continue to be designed to provide a safe and secure environment while meeting the City's requirements with regards to light spillage onto adjacent properties.
Noise and Air Quality	The Noise Study prepared by Gradient Wind Engineering Inc. has been revised to reflect the revised development. The report recommends upgraded building materials and central air conditioning to mitigate noise impacts, specifically for Building C located closest to Carling Avenue. Noise barriers are recommended for outdoor terraces on the rooftops of Building C.
Sunlight	The revised shadow study prepared for the development continues to reflect no undue adverse impacts on adjacent properties.
Microclimate	The Wind Study prepared by Gradient Wing Engineering Inc. has been revised to reflect the updated Concept Plan and concludes that the public realm spaces at grade will all experience acceptable wind conditions throughout the year. Wind screens are proposed for some of the rooftop terraces to ensure comfort.
Supporting Neighbourhood Services	The revised Concept Plan provides a new public park in the southwest corner of the subject property that will be constructed as part of Phase 2 and dedicated to the City of Ottawa as public parkland. The park will fill a void with regards to parkland in the immediate area.

Location of Tall Buildings

The revised development continues to satisfy several of the criteria for the location of tall buildings as set out in policies 9 and 10 of Section 4.11, including:

- / Being located within an area characterized by high-rise buildings with direct access to an arterial road;
- / Being located within 600 metres of rapid transit stations identified on Schedule D of the Official Plan;
- / Providing built form transitions as described in Section 4.11, policy 12.

The revised Concept Plan continues to implement built-form transitions specified in policy 12 including:

- / The use of incremental building heights to achieve transition. The proposed development transitions from a three (3) storey podium adjacent to the residential uses to the south, up to a mid-rise, eight (8) storey building, and then to the high-rise, 20 and 22 storey buildings adjacent to Carling Avenue. The high-rise buildings are located approximately 56 metres from the south property line. The incremental changes in building height provide an appropriate transition into the low-rise neighbourhood.
- / Breaking up the massing of the buildings through the use of podiums along the Mainstreet. The use of podiums on high-rise buildings provide a pedestrian scale along the street. The depth of the lot and the use of lower scale (three (3) storey) podiums and ground-oriented units fronting directly onto Archibald Street provide appropriate transition from the high-rise along the Arterial Mainstreet into the community.
- / The use of a variety of materials and colours help to ground the building while the high-rise portions of the building are lighter in material and look.

- / The high-rise buildings are set back approximately 56 metres from the adjacent low-rise residential uses. The large setback provides significant separation and an appropriate transition from the high-rise buildings to the low-rise neighbourhood.

City of Ottawa Official Plan Amendment No. 150

The revisions to the proposed Concept Plan do not impact on the conformity of the redevelopment plan with Official Plan Amendment No. 150 (OPA 150). The subject property is within the Westgate Secondary Plan area and therefore the plan may permit greater or lesser building heights than those prescribed in OPA 150.

Westgate Secondary Plan

The revised Concept Plan continues to conform to the Westgate Secondary Plan by providing an appropriate and deliberate transition from the low-rise neighbourhood to the south up to Carling Avenue and to the north side of Carling Avenue.

The subject property is within the “Westgate-Carling South Transition Area” as designated in the Secondary Plan. This area is to support the varying roles of Carling Avenue and that development within this area should provide a transitional built form and strong urban design to recognize and protect the low-rise residential context to the south.

As described in the discussion on Section 4.11 of the Official Plan, the revised development concept provides a transitional built form that recognizes and protects the low-rise residential neighbourhood to the south. The use of low-rise podiums, mid-rise buildings, and significant building setbacks, together with ground-oriented housing, landscape buffers, and similar materials will ensure that the proposed development transitions appropriately from the Carling Avenue Arterial Mainstreet.

The southern edge of the subject property is identified as the “Neighbourhood Line”, intended to establish a clear distinction between areas that are anticipated to change over time and ones that are anticipated to undergo very little change. The subject property, located north of the line, is expected to undergo change and as such is required to allow for appropriate transition in terms of building height and uses, setbacks, landscaping, and other measures to protect the low-rise character of the community.

As has been noted throughout, the proposed revised Concept Plan utilizes incremental building heights, setbacks, landscaping, and other measures (e.g. ground-oriented housing, materials) to provide an appropriate transition and protect the low-rise community to the south.

City of Ottawa Comprehensive Zoning By-law

The subject property is currently zoned Arterial Mainstreet, Subzone 10 (AM10) and Residential Fourth Density, subzone N (R4N). The revised Concept Plan is compared to the provisions of the AM 10 zoning in the table below:

Zoning Mechanism	Required	Provided
Minimum Front Yard Setback	No minimum	2.2m
Minimum Corner Side Yard Setback	Buildings A and C: No minimum Building E: 3m	Building A and C: > 3m Building E: 4.2m
Minimum Rear Yard Setback	7.5m	7.5m

Building Wall	At least 50% of the frontage along the front lot line and corner side lot line must be occupied by building walls located within 4.5 metres of the frontage for a Residential use building, and within 3.0 metres for Non-residential and Mixed use buildings	<p>Mixed-Use Buildings within 3m on Carling: 13%</p> <p>Mixed-Use Building within 3m on Archibald: 75% (using the halfway point of the drive aisle as the south edge of the property)</p> <p>Mixed-Use Building within 3m on Meath: 36% (excluding park frontage)</p> <p>Residential Building within 4.5m on Archibald: 30% (using the halfway point of the drive aisle as the north edge of the property)</p>
Ground Floor Height Minimum	4.5m (within 10 metres of Carling Avenue)	4.95m
Glazing Requirement	Minimum: 50% of the surface area of the ground floor façade, measured from the average grade up to a height of 4.5 metres, facing a public street must be comprised of transparent glazing and active customer or resident entrance access doors	> 50%
Minimum Building Height	7.5m (2 storeys)	10.5m (3 storeys)
Maximum Building Height	Up to 20m from rear lot line: 11m Between 20m and 30m from rear lot line: 20m All other cases: 30m	Up to 20m from rear lot line: 10.5m Between 20m and 30m from rear lot line: 25m All other cases: 71m
Amenity Area	5,394 square metres 2,697 square metres communal	> 5,394 square metres of which at least 50% will be communal
Parking	Total Requirement: 587 spaces Residential: 450 spaces Residential Visitor: 110 spaces Retail: 27 spaces	> 587 spaces
Bicycle Parking	459 spaces	> 459 spaces

As with the original concept prepared in April 2017, there are two requested amendments to the Zoning By-law. The first is to reduce the building wall requirement requirements along the front and corner lot lines, and the second is to permit the increased building height. Each of these variances is discussed below.

Building Wall Requirement

The existing zoning requires that 50% of the frontage along Carling Avenue, Archibald and Meath Streets be occupied by buildings. In the case of mixed-use buildings like Building A, B, and C, the requirement is that buildings be located within 3 metres of the lot line, while for residential buildings like Building E, the request is that the building be within 4.5 metres.

As part of the applications, a road widening is being provided along the Carling Avenue frontage that will ensure a minimum of 22.5 metres for Carling Avenue from 2.5 metres within the median. Based on the new property line, 13% of the frontage on Carling Avenue will be occupied by building frontage.

On the west side, along Meath Street, the public park will form a significant portion of the frontage. Building A will be entirely within 3 metres of the property line and represents 36% of the lot line (excluding the park). On the east side, along Archibald Street, Building C is located entirely within 3 metres of the lot line while limited amount of Building E is within 4.5 metres.

The requested amendments are largely as a result of the protection of the “Japanese Steakhouse” pavilion as a heritage element on the site and part of Building A, the overhead hydro lines along Archibald Street, and the proposed public park on Meath Street. The reduction is also a result of the irregular and curving property line along Carling Avenue.

The proposed amendments maintain the intent of the Zoning By-law by framing the street with buildings and creating a quality public realm around the new buildings that will contribute to a compact, mixed-use, urban environment along Carling Avenue. The revised Concept Plan increases the porosity of the site for pedestrians, and provides connections into the site from Carling Avenue to the public park space and into the community to the south.

Building Height

The proposed building heights represent an urban design response to the requirement for a transition from the high-rise buildings along Carling Avenue, to the low-rise neighbourhood to the south. The proposed amendment seeks to increase the permitted building height within 20 metres of the rear property line from 20 metres to 25 metres, and seeks to permit a building height of 71 metres (22 storeys) along Carling Avenue.

The proposed high-rise buildings are all located over 50 metres from the rear property line, abutting Carling Avenue. The building height proposed conforms to the policies of Section 4.11 of the Official Plan given their location in proximity to future rapid transit stations and in an area characterized by high-rise buildings, and given the built form transition provided across the site to protect the low-rise neighbourhood to the south. This transition is achieved through large building setbacks and incremental changes in building height. Podiums are also used to create a pedestrian scale along the public streets (including the internal east-west drive aisle), and ground-oriented units abutting Archibald Street and the future park will provide an appropriate transition and rhythm of development along the local streets.

The eight (8) storey buildings are located approximately 21 metres from the rear lot line and have a height of 25 metres. The request to permit an additional 5 metres of building height in this location is appropriate. The potential impacts of the additional height include overlook into the adjacent outdoor amenity areas, and shadowing. The proposed Concept Plan envisions a public pathway and natural buffer along the south property line. Trees planted will help to protect the privacy of adjacent outdoor amenity areas. Shadow impacts as a result of the increased height do not cause any undue adverse impacts.

In the Traditional Mainstreet zone, an angular plane is required for any development where the rear lot line abuts an R1, R2, R3, or R4 zone. The angular plane is drawn from a point 7.5 metres inside the rear lot line, and 15 metres above grade. A 45 degree plane projects from this point toward the front lot line. Applying the same angular plane provision to the subject property, the proposed building heights are within the angular plane.

In our opinion, the proposed building heights are appropriate for the subject property and provide the opportunity to create a compact, mixed-use environment along an Arterial Mainstreet while still providing an appropriate transition into the adjacent low-rise community.

Conclusion

In considering the revised development and the applicable policy framework, it is our professional opinion that the revised development proposal represents good planning and is in the public interest as it is consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement, conforms to the City of Ottawa Official Plan and Official Plan Amendment No. 150, generally conforms to the policies of the Westgate Secondary Plan, meets the applicable urban design guidelines and maintains the general intent of the Zoning By-law.

The revised Concept Plan continues to advance several key policy objectives of both the Province and the City of Ottawa including: optimizing the use of land within the existing urban boundary, encouraging compatible intensification within designated areas inside the urban boundary, developing property in proximity to rapid transit services with compact, mixed-use development, and contributing to the range of housing types and tenures in the City.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'P. Black', is written over a faint, illegible background of text.

Paul Black, MCIP RPP
Senior Planner